Attachment to Independent Case Review Report For CDRU # 6577 Case file # 95-257976.

Material Examiner: Malone (RQ)

Remarks:

Case resulted in a trial, testimony transcript provided.

CRM - 16163

INDEPENDENT CASE REVIEW REPORT.

Independent Review of	onducted by:	Steve Robertso	n			
Area(s) of Expertise:	Hair and Fibe	ers				
Review commenced at	: 2:45 PM	(Time),	10/23/02	(Date) · .	
File #: 95-257976					· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
Laboratory #(s): 31	027005/311080	57				
	522059		•		٠.	
					. ,	
	•	Examiner(s) & Symbo	İs		
•	Reviewed	Not Reviewed			Reviewed	Not Reviewed
RQ	Χo	.	_		. 🗖	0
TR, TT		, X D			. 0	ם
·		, -				
		Material	s Reviewed			
Trial testimony transcr	ript(s) of:	Michael Malone	S ICCVICWOU			•
Testimony Da	ate(s): June :	13, 1984	Pages:	1-58		
aboratory Report(s):	 			, ,		
		.7005/311080 57	,	Doto	Jan. 11, 1984	
Laboratory Nu Laboratory Nu		2059		Date: Date:	June 4, 1984	 ,
Laboratory Nu	-			Date:		
		•				
Examiner Bench Notes		and unidentified	tèchnician	_		
		7005		_		
	4052	2059		→ ·		
		Page 1	of 3			
٠.		Initials:	Sour-		CRM -	16164

If yes, p	please ide	ntify and/or descr	ibe the material:	submittin	g agency letter	s dated Oct	. 25, 1983 and	
May 14	1, 1984	,					1	:
				•				
٠	٠.					•	•	
		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	Pacu	lts of Rev	view.			
			Kesu	its of icc	, TCAA	•	,	
File #: 95-257976			Item or	Specimen # R	3-Q36, K1-	, K1-K8, K14, K15		
,		·				<u> </u>	,	
	,	Reviev	v of Laborator	v Report(s) and Bench	Notes:		
			lumbered comm	<u> </u>			一 ·	
			es for any "No"					
	methods.	examiner perform, protocols, and an	the appropriate	tests in a scie s available at Yes laboratory re	entifically acce the time of the No X U	e original of the control of the con	etermine quately documente	ed in
	methods	examiner perform, protocols, and an	the appropriate alytic techniques	tests in a scies available at Yes laboratory re Yes X	entifically acce the time of the No X = U eport(s) suppor	e original e inable to De	examination(s)? termine quately documente	ed in
	methods.	examiner perform, protocols, and are examination result h notes?	the appropriate halytic techniques is set forth in the	tests in a scie s available at Yes laboratory re Yes X w of Testin	entifically accepted the time of the No X = U eport(s) support	e original (nable to De ted and ade nable to De	examination(s)? termine quately documente	ed in
)	methods.	examiner perform, protocols, and are examination result h notes?	the appropriate alytic techniques	tests in a scie s available at Yes laboratory re Yes X w of Testin	entifically accepted the time of the No X Deport(s) support Deport(s) no Deport	ne original of inable to De ted and ade nable to De ted	examination(s)? etermine quately documente termine	ed in
)	Are the c	examiner perform, protocols, and are examination result h notes? Note: ladditional page	the appropriate alytic techniques as set forth in the Revie	tests in a scie s available at Yes laboratory re Yes X w of Testin	entifically accepted the time of the No X Deport(s) support Deport(s) no Deport	ne original of inable to De ted and ade nable to De ted	examination(s)? etermine quately documente termine	ed in
) □ Tran	Are the control the bench	examiner perform, protocols, and an examination result h notes? Note: ladditional pages available.	the appropriate halytic techniques is set forth in the Revie	tests in a scie s available at Yes laboratory re Ves X w of Testin nents are ree ' or "Unable	entifically accepted the time of the No X U	te original of hable to De ted and ade nable to De ted and record to De ted and record to De ted and record to the ted and record to	examination(s)? etermine quately documente termine	
) □ Tran) Test	Are the ethe bench	examiner perform, protocols, and an examination result h notes? Note: ladditional page tavailable.	the appropriate alytic techniques as set forth in the Revieus Numbered community and "No"	tests in a scie s available at Yes laboratory re Ves X w of Testin nents are ree ' or "Unable	entifically accepted the time of the No X U	te original e inable to De ted and ade nable to De ted and ade nable to De ted are or on the response at the r	examination(s)? etermine quately documente termine es	ermine
Tran) Test) Test	Are the ethe bench	examiner perform, protocols, and an examination result h notes? Note: l additional page t available. Insistent with the least the second control of the	the appropriate allytic techniques as set forth in the Revier Numbered community for any "Not aboratory reports sench notes?	tests in a scie s available at Yes laboratory re Yes X w of Testin nents are rec ' or "Unable	entifically accepted the time of the No X U	e original e hable to De ted and ade nable to De ted and ade nable to De ted are to De	examination(s)? etermine quately documents termine Unable to Det	ermine
Tran) Test) Test	Are the ethe bench	examiner perform, protocols, and an examination result h notes? Note: ladditional page tavailable.	the appropriate allytic techniques as set forth in the Revier Numbered community for any "Not aboratory reports sench notes?	tests in a scie s available at Yes laboratory re Yes X w of Testin nents are rec ' or "Unable	entifically accepted the time of the No X U	e original e finable to De ted and ade nable to De ted and ade nable to De ted are on a Response X □ No	examination(s)? etermine quately documente termine es	ermine
Tran) Test) Test	Are the ethe bench	examiner perform, protocols, and an examination result h notes? Note: l additional page t available. Insistent with the least the second control of the	the appropriate allytic techniques as set forth in the Revier Numbered community for any "Not aboratory reports sench notes?	tests in a scie s available at Yes laboratory re Yes X w of Testin nents are rec ' or "Unable	entifically accepted the time of the No X U	e original e finable to De ted and ade nable to De ted and ade nable to De ted are on a Response X □ No	examination(s)? etermine quately documents termine Unable to Det	ermine
Tran Test Test	Are the ethe bench	examiner perform, protocols, and an examination result h notes? Note: l additional page t available. Insistent with the least the second control of the	the appropriate allytic techniques as set forth in the Revier Numbered community for any "Not aboratory reports sench notes?	tests in a scie s available at Yes laboratory re Yes X w of Testin nents are rec ' or "Unable	entifically accepted the time of the No X U	e original e finable to De ted and ade nable to De ted and ade nable to De ted are on a Response X □ No	examination(s)? etermine quately documents termine Unable to Det	ermine

Sur

Initials:

Comments

(Set forth by above question #, if applicable. Use "Additional Comments" Sheet, if needed)

File #: 95-257976	•
#1. It cannot be determined from the notes if the tests were performed in a scientifically accept	ptable manner.
#2. The results are not adequately documented in the notes. The notes are not initialed or date	ed, are in pencil
instead of ink and use abbreviations difficult to interpret. The technician did not document the	ne recovery of hair
from the evidence.	-
#3. The testimony about the significance of the hair match (p. 36) that it would be "highly un	likely" to find
somebody else with head and pubic hair like the victim's hair is much stronger than the opin	ion in the lab report
that the hair "could have originated from the victim". The report further states "It is pointed	out that hair
comparisons do not constitute a basis for positive personal identification". The testimony is a	also much stronger
than this statement in the report.	
Review completed at: 4:30 PM (Time), 10/23/02 (Date)	
Total time spent conducting review (to nearest 1/4 hour): 1.75 hrs.	
I hereby certify that I conducted this review in an independent, unbiased manner and that the are fully documented on this report consisting of a total of3 pages.	results of my review
Stine Roberts	Oct. 23, 2002
/ (Signature)	(Date)

Page 3 of 3

Initials:

Same Carachite